A total of 157 student writing samples taken from students in Advanced Composition classes (EN300) were scored by two individual faculty raters using a revised version of the AAC&U Critical Thinking Rubric. Faculty raters attended training and norming sessions before using the rubric to score papers.

Each raters’ scores for the separate traits were averaged to compute overall scores for the student paper. If the two individual raters’ overall scores differed 1.0 or less, then the two raters’ trait and overall scores were averaged to for the total overall and trait scores for the student papers. If the two individual raters’ overall scores differed more 1.0, then a third individual rater also scored the student paper using the AAC&U Critical Thinking Rubric.

The four traits scored were:
1. Explanation of issues
2. Evidence (selecting and using information to investigate a conclusion)
3. Student’s position (perspective, thesis, hypothesis
4. Conclusions and related outcomes

Each trait is scored on a 5-point scale of:
0= Not Meeting Benchmark
1= Meeting Benchmark
2= Milestone A,
3= Milestone B
4= Capstone.

Critical thinking is a habit of mind characterized by the comprehensive exploration of issues, ideas, artifacts, and events before accepting or formulating an opinion or conclusion.